PRIORITIZING EFFECTIVE FACTORS IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF RURAL TOURISM IN ILAM PROVINCE USING THE FUZZY VIKOR METHOD

Gholamreza Ghasemnejad[1], Iraj Saei Arasi[2]*, Hossein Aghajani Marsa[3]

Department of Sociology, Central Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran.
Department of Sociology, Abhar Branch, Islamic Azad University, Zanjan, Iran
(Corresponding author).
Department of Sociology, Central Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran.

Abstract:

Ilam province has the best tourism villages in the field of tourism. Tourism development in these villages, in addition to having a relatively long history, is very intense and crowded, especially in certain seasons of the year. Therefore, the present study was conducted with the aim of prioritizing the effective factors in the development of rural tourism in Ilam province using the fuzzy VIKOR method. The approach of this research is a mixed exploratory (qualitative-quantitative) approach. The data collection method in this study is library and field. The statistical population in the qualitative stage was 15 experts selected by the snowball method, and in the quantitative stage, 384 heads of rural households were determined as the sample size using the Cochran formula and stratified sampling method. The research questionnaire was researcher-made and confirmed with a Cronbach's alpha reliability of 0.93. The findings indicated that 5 main categories and 20 subcategories were identified as effective factors in the development of rural tourism in Ilam province. Also, the results showed that, using the fuzzy VIKOR technique, adequate supervision and effective control levers regarding improvement, repair and maintenance have obtained the first rank. Business prosperity with the development of commercial tourism and education and generalization of communication methods in tourist areas have obtained the second rank and the ideology governing the society (beliefs, convictions) in the formation of types of tourism have obtained the third rank.

Keywords: Rural Tourism Development, VIKOR, Data-Based Theory

Introduction:

Currently, tourism is considered one of the largest and most diverse industries in the world, and its rapid growth has led to many social, economic, and environmental changes, and for this reason, it has become an important field of study among researchers. Economically, tourism generates the most revenue, and foreign exchange receipts from tourism are provided more than oil products, automobiles, and communication equipment. Tourism has played an important role in encouraging investment in infrastructure, generating income for the government, and creating direct and indirect jobs around the world. One of the pillars of tourism development is demand for it, which also has a complex structure; because the increase or decrease in a country's share of global tourism revenues depends on factors and variables that can vary depending on the type of country, administrative and executive issues, and the level of available statistics and information. Today, tourism development in all areas, whether at the national,

regional, or international levels, has attracted the attention of government planners and private companies. Many countries have increasingly realized that they must take the initiative and seek new ways to improve their economic situation. The awareness of societies that tourism provides a very suitable and considerable source of foreign exchange income to a country's economy has led to tourism finding a very broad concept in various economic, social and cultural dimensions and being considered as an industry. Many countries consider this dynamic industry as the main source of income, employment, private sector growth and infrastructure development. Although conditions are different in different regions, tourism is always an important factor for economic development (Imani et al., 2015: 23).

Statistics from the World Tourism Organization indicate that in 2008, tourism revenue was $944 billion, and this figure will reach about $2,000 billion in 2020. Statistics from the World Tourism Organization indicate that in 2010, France, the United States, China, Spain, and Italy were the top five countries in attracting tourists to their countries (World Tourism Organization, 2010). Tourism can be considered as a source of foreign exchange income and job creation along with other industries, and there is a close relationship between the arrival of tourists to a region and the economic growth and development of that region (Pert, 2011: 140). The tourism industry has many results and achievements, including the aspect of job creation and its impact on the developmental, economic, and social functions in the region or country (Haljivas, 2003: 2).

The major and fundamental policies of the country's cultural heritage and tourism sector are described in the 1384-1404 Development Vision Document, as stated in paragraph 5 of this vision document: Increasing domestic tourism and achieving an appropriate share of the global tourism market by diversifying the Iranian tourism market and using all capacities with priority on attracting rural, cultural and natural tourists to increase GDP and develop employment. In the twenty-year vision of our country, Iran, it is predicted that by 2020, twenty million foreign tourists should enter Iran annually. All governments are trying to encourage more tourists to visit their sightseeing, tourist and religious centers by making detailed plans and recognizing the needs and demands of tourists, so that in this way they can earn income and also provide the basis for creating sustainable jobs (Asadi and Daraya, 2011: 144).

Despite the unparalleled importance of the tourism industry in economic development and prosperity, appropriate policies have not been made in the country regarding its promotion, and most of the efforts related to the development of the tourism industry in the last decade have been focused on the privatization of accommodation units, tourism advertising, human resource training, incentive policies for the construction of Iranian and world tourism facilities, and tax discounts, which have mainly taken into account the attraction of demand. While the challenges facing this industry not only require greater strength and durability of demand-side policies, but also require policy-making on the supply side and organizing the structure of business activities. Therefore, tourism development should be examined as a strategy from various economic, social, ecological, and institutional aspects (Vahedpour and Jafari, 2011, 84).

Rural tourism is one of the prominent tourism in the field of tourism. Today, the development of rural tourism in different countries has attracted everyone's attention as an effective catalyst, both economically and from cultural, social, and political aspects. In our country, this issue has been considered for a long time. However, given the important role of this industry in the development of rural areas, there are always obstacles in terms of the country's cultural and

social conditions that prevent the development of this industry, and Ilam province is no exception. The prosperity of tourism in each region depends on national and regional conditions and characteristics, including government policies, social, cultural and political factors of each region, natural and historical attractions, and the quantity and quality of services provided to tourists. Our country, Iran, is among the top ten countries in the world in terms of the existence of historical and cultural monuments due to its ancient civilization and the presence of followers of different religions and sects (Sultan Moradi, 2011:14).

Ilam province has the best tourist villages in Iran in the field of tourism. Tourism development in these villages, in addition to having a relatively long history, is very intense and crowded; especially in certain seasons of the year. In this way, annually, a very high volume of tourists from various regions and cultures, sometimes very different from the local culture of the village residents, come into close contact and interaction with the local people, and in addition to the positive or negative effects they have on this society in environmental and economic dimensions, they also cause significant and numerous cultural effects and changes. The increasing studies that have been conducted in recent years regarding the development of tourism in rural areas in Iran and its effects and consequences have mainly focused on the economic consequences of this phenomenon, and the social, cultural and environmental consequences have been less considered.

Therefore, given the importance of tourism, the development of rural tourism in order to exploit the capacities and capabilities of villages in developing countries such as Iran is high. Despite having cultural and tourist attractions, most Iranian villages are not prepared to meet the necessary needs in the field of rural tourism development, such as capital, technology, and information. As a result, to help deprived rural communities, including the villages of Ilam province, there is a need to create a platform for creating businesses. The reality indicates that this industry is not growing in Iran compared to other countries in the world. In fact, many parts of Iran, despite having many attractions, are deprived of even domestic tourists. Ilam province, considering the potential and capacities of historical, cultural, and ecotourism tourism in and around the villages, its location on the Karbala route, its young workforce, and the service nature of the economic nature of the villages of the province, has a suitable basis for creating businesses. Despite having many unique tourist attractions, the villages of Ilam province have unfortunately not yet benefited from the achievements of the tourism industry as much as they should. This research will identify the factors affecting the development of this industry in Ilam province, given the importance of developing the rural tourism industry. Therefore, the questions of this research are: What are the effective factors in the development of rural tourism in Ilam province? How is the prioritization of the effective factors in the development of rural tourism in Ilam province?

Theoretical foundations:

Tourism is an activity that in today's world has the ability to influence the balanced and comprehensive development process in Iran and different countries and is of interest to many politicians, planners, and executive and operational managers in countries. This phenomenon (tourism) is one of the phenomena of the twentieth century and cannot be ignored, and millions of people travel in the world every year. The presence of tourists in countries and destination places can have various advantages and disadvantages. For example, the presence of tourists in

a country, in addition to economic development and cultural exchanges, is the best advertisement for the existence of security in that country (Brindan, 2016: 239).

Currently, unlike in previous years, when only the positive aspects and effects of tourism were emphasized, but today, considering that tourism occurs in an environment and space that consists of human factors and natural features, despite having many advantages, tourism can cause losses to tourist destination areas, the correct and correct recognition of the advantages and disadvantages of tourism provides the opportunity to strengthen the positive aspects of tourism and reduce the negative results and consequences of tourism with careful planning and more effort.

Tourism development leaves many effects in the economic, cultural and political dimensions in the country. Employment creation, the flow of economic capital, increased foreign income due to the increase in demand for foreign travel and, consequently, increased security in the country are among the positive effects of tourism. Foreign exchange receipts from tourism are much higher than the export of petroleum products or automobiles and communication equipment, as well as the sale of raw minerals and other items. It can also be said that tourism plays an important and significant role in encouraging investment in infrastructure, generating income for the government and the private sector, and creating direct and indirect employment (Ghafourian and Sedaghati, 2011: 22).

Tourism can lead to the creation of employment, increased income and improvements in economic structures in the tourism destination community, as an example (Mahmoudinia et al., 2011: 187). The effects of tourism on economic growth include the following: 1- Earning foreign exchange

-2Increasing the national income of the host community

-3Increasing government income

Each researcher has examined and analyzed the positive and negative effects of tourism from different perspectives and aspects. For example, (Saidi, 2014: 22) announced the advantages and disadvantages of tourism as follows:

A) Potential advantages of the tourism industry

-Creating new job opportunities

-Increasing taxes and money that the government receives.

-Community empowerment and thus creating more opportunities for development and progress

-Increasing financial resources to preserve cultural and natural monuments

-Developing local, indigenous and artisanal industries

b) Disadvantages of tourism

-Seasonality of jobs

-Increasing cost of living for residents of the area

-Air pollution

-Increased traffic, vehicles and traffic jams

-Negative effects of this industry on cultural and natural monuments

-Increased crime rate

-Transfer of income outside the region and increasing dependence on imported goods and services

-Excessive dependence of the region or area on the tourism industry and one-dimensionalization of economic activities

Tourism in tourist destinations has had a positive impact on the country's economic development, especially foreign exchange earnings, employment rates, taxes, etc. (Richard, 2011: 87). The tourism industry primarily generates significant foreign exchange earnings and job opportunities as a tool for economic development (Kala and Mikhouri, 2011: 87). That is why different countries are trying to provide the opportunity for satisfaction and benefit from the positive aspects of this industry by providing and valuing tourist attractions in areas with tourism potential (Rosentropov and Jo, 2009).

The presence of visitors in any country affects the life pattern of the local people, and visitors are also influenced by the culture of the host country and the values there (Falahi, 2013: 65).

It goes without saying that the costs of tourism and attracting tourists will help develop and progress tourist and sightseeing places, but along with the countless benefits of tourism, it is also necessary to recognize the negative aspects and results of tourists entering a country.

The increase in tourists leads to the development of small businesses and also to increased economic investments in tourist areas, which in turn requires more labor and reduces youth unemployment and economic turnover in these areas (Page et al., 2017).

And some believe that tourists, by being present in forests, parks, rivers and seashores, cause environmental destruction and disrupt the peace of animal and plant species, so the losses and damages caused by their presence are greater than the income they bring to the region and the country (Falah, 2013: 67).

Tourism can be successful when the indigenous residents of tourist areas can benefit from the economic and financial benefits of the presence of tourists and at the same time, there is no damage and destruction to nature and the traditional and pristine texture of tourist areas is also preserved.

Empirical foundations of research

Talebi et al. (2017), in a study titled, Prioritizing the components of tourism development in Iran with a fuzzy hybrid multi-criteria decision-making approach Case study: Cultural Heritage, Handicrafts and Tourism Organization of Iran, with a comprehensive and systematic view of tourism and using similar studies in Iran and the world, attempted to identify factors affecting tourism development, prioritize and provide solutions to improve tourist attraction and tourism development with the help of the FDANP hybrid method in Iran. The results of data analysis showed that "tourism facilities and infrastructure" is the most influential criterion and "natural factors" is the most influential criterion in tourism development. Among the six criteria affecting tourism development, the criterion "tourism facilities and infrastructure" with a weight of 0.2 and the sub-criterion "domestic investment security" gained the most importance. Zargham Borujeni and Azizi (2017). In a study titled, "Evaluation of Factors Affecting the Development of Tourism in Archaeological and Historical Sites (Fuzzy Approach)," by identifying the factors affecting the development of this type of tourism and prioritizing these factors based on the multi-criteria optimization method and fuzzy consensus solution, they sought to provide solutions for the development of tourism in archaeological and historical sites. The results of this study show that "private and public sector participation", "status of infrastructure in historical sites", "education of local people about the importance of historical sites", "continuous research in the field of historical sites" and "continuous monitoring of them"

are the five main factors affecting the development of tourism in historical sites, respectively. Mohammadi et al. (2017) in an article titled "Development of Tourism Industry Development Strategies in Ilam Province" describes the existing opportunities and threats as well as identifying internal and external factors affecting the development of the tourism industry in Ilam Province. This research considers the opening of the international border with Iraq and the existing potential opportunities such as the possibility of transforming Mehran County into a free trade zone and the existence of high-ranking officials in the neighboring country of Iraq as unique advantages in Mehran County. Azadkhani, Hosseinzadeh and Salimi Bavandpour (2018) in a study titled "Investigating the Socio-Cultural Effects of Urban Tourism Development in Ilam" attempted to evaluate and analyze the socio-cultural effects of urban tourism in Ilam from the perspectives of residents and tourists entering Ilam City. The results showed that the development of tourism in the city of Ilam had a significant impact on social and cultural changes, and there was a significant relationship between the development of tourism and the increase in cultural and social changes. Also, five factors were identified as socio-cultural effects in Ilam city: increasing social relations and establishing appropriate communication among citizens, getting to know the city at the regional level, increasing self-reliance and decreasing self-confidence of residents, changing the pattern of intimacy between city residents, and congestion and hustle and bustle. Sae-e-Arsi (2018) conducted a study titled, Sociological explanation of the socio-cultural and behavioral obstacles to the development of the tourism industry in Zanjan province, with the aim of identifying the economic, social, cultural, political and behavioral obstacles to the development of the tourism industry in Zanjan province. The ranking of factors affecting the underdevelopment of the tourism industry in Zanjan province based on the Friedman test is as follows: high cost of goods and services, poor transportation and communication infrastructure, lack of health and welfare facilities, poor information and advertising. Sindoglu et al. (2013), in their study titled "Cultural and Social Barriers to Tourism Industry Development: The Case of Turkey", stated that excessive congestion and rush to specific tourist spots can be prevented by adopting policies to distribute tourism facilities at the national level in a way that creates diverse attractions for tourists. Also, centralized planning at the national level regarding tourism cannot function efficiently and effectively, and it is better to use a decentralized system. Akrivos et al. (2014) studied the extent of use of sustainable resources in tourism entrepreneurship in the Oritania region of Greece in an article. The findings indicate that the entrepreneurs' approach is that tourism does not harm the environment, so they do not need to be sensitive to the environment. There is no teamwork spirit among tourism entrepreneurs and local authorities, although they believe that a proper strategy for progress and development has been adopted. Stratton et al. (2015) identified the potential of cultural tourism through cultural consumption among tourists and stated that incomplete cultural management will endanger cultural heritage. Another important limitation in the development of cultural tourism is the low participation of the population in cultural and tourism events held in the country. The results of the study indicate that the current situation calls for a more flexible and innovative approach to the development of the tourism industry in the country. Qing Chu in 2015 in an article "Cultural barriers and tourism development in Yunnan Province, China" has examined. Daniel Anthony Sihasal et al. (2016), in a study titled Tourism Development Potential Strategy in the Namaluta Coastal Region of Indonesia, examined the internal and external factors of tourism development. This study used the SOWT model to formulate tourism

development strategies for the studied area, and the results showed that the strategy for developing the nature tourism sector was the best strategy. Devin et al. (2017) examined the "Opportunities and Challenges of Northern Ireland Hotel Managers Based on Cultural Attraction Management". The results of these studies indicate that increasing the level of management in employee training is an important factor in facilitating the hospitality industry. Dutton et al. (2017) compared They held a conference titled "Cultural Barriers in Hospitality" in 2017. The event, jointly organized by the United Nations, the World Tourism Organization, and the country's Ministry of Tourism, emphasized greater diversity in tourism facilities, products, and increased domestic tourism.

Research Methodology: The current study, which aims to identify the effective factors in the development of rural tourism in Ilam province, is an analytical-descriptive research with an applied nature because it is trying to benefit various organizations and bodies involved in tourism, especially rural tourism, from the results of this research. In terms of the type of research, it is considered an analytical-descriptive research that has been conducted using a qualitative method. The statistical population is experts (rural tourism experts consisting of experienced university professors and tourism sector activists and managers who have sufficient knowledge and experience regarding the subject of rural tourism). Since experts and experts who are proficient in the research subject are not clearly identifiable, the purposive and snowball sampling methods were used. The number of samples in the qualitative stage was determined according to the theoretical saturation level. With this process, 15 experts were identified as sufficient for interviews. The data collection tool is interviews. In this study, semi-structured interviews were used to identify the factors affecting the development of rural tourism in Ilam province. The analysis section of this study was conducted using theme analysis.

Research findings

Open coding	Pivotal code	Selected code
Entrepreneurial Awareness Personality Traits Prior Knowledge and Experience Cognitive Abilities	Individual factors	Factors affecting the development of tourism in villages in Ilam province
Fair distribution of income and eradication of poverty in tourist areas Business boom with the development of commercial tourism Increasing the purchasing power of indigenous people Increasing GDP through the tourism industry	Economic factors	
Improving the country's political relations Government facilities in tourist areas Government distribution policies in tourist areas Government tax policies in tourist areas	Political factors	

Job creation and unemployment reduction Preserving the foundations of society in tourist areas Educating and generalizing communication methods in tourist areas The ideology that governs society (beliefs, convictions) in the formation of types of tourism	Cultural-social factors	
Welfare, service and accommodation system in the tourism sector and basic facilities Direct transportation facilities between the villages of Ilam province and neighboring provinces The country's connection with the international banking system Adequate supervision and effective control levers regarding improvement, repair and maintenance	Infrastructure factors	

As can be seen in Table (9), 5 main themes and 20 sub-themes were extracted as factors affecting the development of tourism in the villages of Ilam province.

In this stage, after determining the importance of the criteria and sub-criteria, fifteen options are ranked and ranked.

Step 1: Evaluation of options by experts:

In this stage, based on Table (1), the importance of the options is evaluated using fuzzy numbers, taking into account the indicators. In this study, 15 experts were used to evaluate the options. Also, the identified criteria are 20 criteria.

Step 2: Formation of the decision matrix

The average of the evaluation results of the 15 experts is aggregated in a matrix.

Step 3: De-scaling the decision matrix

In this step, we must convert the fuzzy decision matrix into a fuzzy de-scaled matrix. To obtain the matrix, the following steps must be taken:

Determine the best and worst values for each criterion:

The best and worst values for each criterion are identified and ranked accordingly $\tilde{f}_j^{\circ}$ و $\tilde{f}_j^*$ It is called.

$\tilde{f}_j^* = \underset{i}{Max}\ \tilde{f}_{ij}$ i=1,2,....,n   for $j \epsilon j^b$) Best value)

$\tilde{f}_j^{\circ} = \underset{i}{Min}\ \tilde{f}_{ij}$ i=1,2,....,   for $j \epsilon j^b$) Worst value)

Obtaining normalized values

If normalized values are obtained as follows $\tilde{f}_j^{\circ} = (l_j^{\circ}, m_j^{\circ}, r_j^{\circ})$ و $\tilde{f}_j^* = (l_j^*, m_j^*, r_j^*)$.

$\tilde{d}_{ij} = (\tilde{f}_j^* \ominus \tilde{f}_{ij})/(r_j^* - l_j^{\circ})$ For the best value for the criterion:

$\tilde{d}_{ij} = (\tilde{f}_{ij} \ominus \tilde{f}_j^{\circ})/(r_j^{\circ} - l_j^*)$ For the worst value for the criterion:

Step 4: Calculate the values $\tilde{S}_i, \tilde{R}_i$

$\tilde{R}_i = (R_i^l, R_i^m, R_i^r)$ و $\tilde{s}_i = (s_i^l, s_i^m, s_i^r)$

$$\tilde{S}_i = \sum_{j=1}^{I} (\tilde{w}_j \otimes \tilde{d}_{ij})$$

$$\tilde{R}_i = max_j(\tilde{w}_j \otimes \tilde{d}_{ij})$$

Step 5: Calculation

$$\tilde{Q}_i = (Q_{i}^{l}, Q_{i}^{m}, Q_{i}^{r})$$

$$\tilde{Q}_i = v\frac{(\tilde{s}_i \ominus \tilde{s}^*)}{\tilde{s}^{\cdot r} - \tilde{s}^{\cdot l}} \oplus (1 - v)\frac{(\tilde{R}_i \ominus \tilde{R}^*)}{R^{\cdot r} - R^{\cdot l}}$$

That:

$$\tilde{s}^* = min_i \ \tilde{s}_i$$

$$\tilde{s}^{\cdot r} = max_i \ s_i^r$$

$$\tilde{R}^* = min_i \ \tilde{R}_i$$

$$\tilde{R}^{\cdot r} = max_i \ R_i^r$$

Parameter V is a weight for maximum group utility, the value of which can be between 0 and 1, which is considered 0.5 in this study.

The results of the fourth and fifth steps are given in Table:(19-4)

Table (2) Values of R, S, Q

Criteria	S			R			Q		
1	(-0/023	0/006	0/031)	(-0/022	0/022	0/044)	(0/491	0/834	1/062)
2	(-0/020	0/009	0/034)	(-0/017	0/027	0/048)	(1/826	1/723	2/530)
3	(-0/019	0/009	0/035)	(-0/008	0/036	0/057)	(2/228	1/884	2/715)
4	(-0/020	0/008	0/036)	(-0/019	0/030	0/078)	(1/558	1/532	2/162)
5	(-0/019	0/009	0/035)	(-0/024	0/025	0/073)	(1/875	1/772	2/674)
6	(-0/015	0/013	0/037)	(0/040	0/085	0/088)	(3/631	2/946	3/731)
7	(-0/015	0/013	0/037)	(0/036	0/080	0/088)	(3/523	2/895	3/764)
8	(-0/013	0/016	0/039)	(0/040	0/085	0/088)	(4/751	3/695	4/844)
9	(-0/013	0/015	0/039)	(0/040	0/085	0/088)	(4/724	3/538	3/664)
10	(-0/023	0/003	0/029)	(-0/009	0/010	0/029)	(0/292	0/117	0/069)
11	(-0/023	0/003	0/028)	(-0/017	0/007	0/029)	(0/419	0/026	0/20)
12	(-0/023	0/004	0/029)	(-0/039	0/010	0/058)	(0/614	0/265	0/165)
13	(-0/022	0/004	0/030)	(-0/007	0/017	0/031)	(0/894	0/484	0/646)
14	(-0/022	0/003	0/028)	(-0/018	0/009	0/037)	(0/151	-0/048	0/26)
15	(-0/023	0/003	0/029)	(0/002	0/021	0/037)	(0/329	0/110	0/07)
16	(-0/013	0/016	0/039)	(0/040	0/085	0/088)	(4/754	3/695	4/844)
17	(-0/013	0/015	0/039)	(0/040	0/085	0/088)	(4/724	3/538	4/664)
18	(-0/023	0/003	0/029)	(-0/009	0/010	0/029)	(0/292	0/117	0/069)
19	(-0/023	0/003	0/028)	(-0/017	0/007	0/029)	(0/419	0/026	0/20)
20	(-0/023	0/004	0/029)	(-0/039	0/010	0/058)	(0/614	0/265	0/165)

Step 6: Defuzzification of R, S and Q values

The fuzzy values of S, R and Q are determined according to the following formula:

If $\tilde{N}$) $\tilde{N} = (l, m, r)$ is a fuzzy number.(

$$Crisp(\tilde{N}) = \frac{2m+l+r}{4}$$

Table (3) shows the fuzzy and definite values of S, R and Q.

Table (3) Determinate values of R, S, Q

Criteria	R	S	Q
1	0/0049	0/0167	0/8056
2	0/0080	0/0211	1/9508
3	0/0086	0/0300	2/1781
4	/0073	0/0294	1/6967
5	0/0082	0/0245	2/0235
6	0/0118	0/0745	3/3140
7	0/0117	0/0712	3/3695
8	0/0144	0/0745	4/2469
9	0/0140	0/0745	4/1167
10	0/0030	0/0099	0/1494
11	0/0028	0/0069	0/0661
12	0/0035	0/0098	0/3277
13	0/0043	0/0117	0/6274
14	0/0025	0/0093	-0/0514
15	0/0029	0/0203	0/1185
16	0/0144	0/0745	4/2469
17	0/0140	0/0745	4/1167
18	0/0030	0/0099	0/1494
19	0/0028	0/0069	0/0661
20	0/0035	0/0098	0/3277

Step 7: Descending ranking of options based on R, S and Q values:

In this step, the options are ranked based on R, S and Q values. Table (4-21) shows the ranking of options:

Table (4) Definite values of R, S, Q

Option	Company	R	S	Q
1	Entrepreneurial awareness	7	6	7
2	Personality traits	9	8	9
3	Prior knowledge and experience	11	11	11
4	Cognitive abilities	8	10	8
5	Fair distribution of income and eradication of poverty in tourism areas	10	9	10
6	Business prosperity with the development of commercial tourism	13	13	13
7	Increasing the purchasing power of indigenous people	12	12	12
8	Increasing the gross domestic product through the tourism industry	15	13	15
9	Improving the country's political relations	14	13	14

10	Government facilities in tourism areas	4	4	4
11	Government distribution policies in tourism areas	20	13	20
12	Government tax policies in tourism areas	5	3	5
13	Employment creation and reducing unemployment	6	5	6
14	Maintaining the foundations of society in tourism areas	19	10	19
15	Education and generalization of communication methods in tourism areas	3	7	3
16	The ideology that governs society (beliefs, beliefs) in the formation of types of tourism	17	11	17
17	The welfare, service and accommodation system in the tourism sector and primary facilities	18	11	18
18	Direct transportation facilities between the villages of Ilam province and neighboring provinces	1	2	1
19	The country's connection with the international banking system	16	12	16
20	Adequate supervision and effective control levers regarding improvement, repair and maintenance	2	1	2

Step 8: Final Option

In this step, we make a decision based on the values of R, S and Q related to the options that are sorted in descending order. For decision-making, two conditions are examined and based on these two conditions, three states arise on which a decision is made:

a) Condition 1: Acceptable Advantage Condition

If A (1), A (2) are the first and second options based on the value of Q, respectively, and n represents the number of options, then equation (15) holds: $[Q (A^{(2)}) - Q (A^{(1)})] \geq 1/n-1$

Check the first condition:

$Q (A^{(1)}) = -0.051$

$Q (A^{(2)}) = 0.061$

$Q (A^{(I)}) = 4.247$

$[Q (A^{(2)}) - Q (A^{(1)})] = 0.117$

$1/n-1 = 0.0526$ The first condition is met

b) Condition 2: Acceptable stability condition in decision making

Option A (1) must be recognized as the superior rank in at least one of the groups R and S.

The second condition is met.

The states that arise:

The first state: When the first condition is not met, a set of options are selected as superior options according to the following relationship:

,….., $A^{(M}$ ($A^{(2)}$, $A^{(1)} = $ Top Options

The maximum value of M is calculated according to the following equation: $1/n-1 < Q (A^{(1)}) -$

$Q (A^{(M)}$ (

Second case: When only the second condition is not met, two options A (1) and A (2) are selected as the best options.

Third case: If both conditions are met, the ranking will be based on Q. (In descending order: the lower the Q, the better the option)

Given that the first and second conditions are met, option number 18 (direct transportation facilities between the villages of Ilam province and neighboring provinces) is selected as the best option. As mentioned, the aim of the research is to rank the options, so the other options are ranked based on the Q values in Table 4-21.

Discussion and Conclusion:

The planning and decision-making process in the tourism industry with the aim of improving processes and the prosperity and development of this industry is dependent on recognizing the facilities and capabilities. In this regard, the location, quality, functional characteristics and other effective factors of tourist attraction points are studied, and then the special and important points are evaluated and qualitatively examined. Also, the evaluation, classification and composition of individuals and social groups of tourism and how they use the set of attractive tourism spaces, accommodation and catering and infrastructure facilities are among the goals of this section. The evaluation of the goals of the city's tourism development and prosperity plan is also achieved by identifying the development capabilities and removing obstacles and deficiencies in this sector. Unfortunately, in recent years, we have experienced a shortage and decline in tourists. The reason for this decline in the field of tourism is tension. That is, it is undoubtedly one of the harmful effects of sanctions on our tourism sector. Right now, if you want to go to a country that you feel is not politically stable, you will change your decision to travel and go somewhere else. The inadequacy of the welfare, service and accommodation system in the tourism sector and the lack of basic facilities, such as suitable accommodation and health services, and the lack of adequate supervision and effective control levers regarding improvement, repair and maintenance are among the inadequacies of welfare facilities and services in the lack of development of rural tourism in Ilam province.

After conducting interviews and implementing them, the interview texts were systematically examined to find the main factors. In the first step, propositions (dimensions and characteristics) were extracted from the interview texts. In the next step, the data were analyzed at the sentence and phrase level and subcategories were discovered. That is, after extracting the propositions, factors were formulated with the categories that were made. During the detailed analysis of the data, concepts were created through their common use. Coding was done directly from the participants' interview transcripts or, depending on the case, the transcripts were further reviewed and data analysis was performed more carefully, more than ten times to reach logical saturation. For the main categories, their dimensions and characteristics were iteratively conducted. The boundaries of each category and their dimensions were not definitively determined at the beginning of the analysis, and these categories were revised throughout the analysis. The findings showed that 5 main themes and 20 sub-themes were extracted as factors affecting the development of rural tourism in Ilam province. These themes were: individual factors (entrepreneurial awareness, personality traits, prior knowledge and experience, cognitive abilities); economic factors (fair distribution of income and eradication of poverty in tourism areas, business prosperity with the development of commercial tourism, increasing the purchasing power of indigenous people, increasing GDP through the tourism industry); Political factors (improvement of the country's political relations, government facilities in tourism areas, government distribution policies in tourism areas, government tax policies in tourism areas);

socio-cultural factors (employment generation and unemployment reduction, maintaining the foundations of society in tourism areas, education and generalization of communication methods in tourism areas, the ideology governing society (beliefs, convictions) in the formation of types of tourism) and infrastructural factors (welfare, service and accommodation system in the tourism sector and primary facilities, direct transportation facilities between Iran and European countries, the country's connection with the international banking system, adequate supervision and effective control levers regarding improvement, repair and maintenance). Sandgol and Sharifinia (2016) showed that tourism development in Ghaemshahr County faces a lack of infrastructure, service, organizational and advertising tourism facilities to attract tourists. The results of the study by Imani et al. (2015) showed that among the obstacles to tourism development in Minoodasht County, managerial obstacles play the most important role, followed by economic, infrastructural, social, and environmental obstacles in the following ranks. The results of the study by Veisi and Mehmandost (2015) show that domestic and foreign political, institutional, organizational, infrastructural, and economic factors have a significant impact on the lack of tourism development in Iran, and that cultural, religious, security, and tourist attractions factors do not have a significant impact as obstacles to the development of the tourism industry in Iran. The results of the study by Mehrabi et al. (2012) indicated the existence of seven structural and main factors, and the extracted factors were: 1- Infrastructural factor 2- Political factor, 3- Cultural factor 4- Government factor 5- Human factor 6- Management factor, and 7- Economic factor, which explain the largest changes in the test variance, respectively. The results indicate that poor infrastructure and infrastructure facilities are among the most important obstacles to tourism development, followed by political obstacles and problems and cultural obstacles that have had the greatest impact on the lack of tourism development.

- Considering the confirmation of the impact of individual factors on the development of rural tourism in Ilam Province, it is suggested that:
-    -Paying attention to entrepreneurial awareness in the tourism region of Ilam Province
-    -Paying attention to the personality characteristics of entrepreneurs in the tourism region of Ilam Province
-    -Taking advantage of previous knowledge and experience
- Regarding the confirmation of the impact of economic factors on the development of rural tourism in Ilam Province, it is suggested that:
-    -Fair distribution of income and eradication of poverty in the tourism region of Ilam Province
-    -Business prosperity with the development of commercial tourism
-    -Adequate supervision and effective control levers regarding improvement, repair and maintenance
-    -Increasing the purchasing power of indigenous people - local people
- Regarding the confirmation of the impact of political factors on the development of rural tourism in Ilam Province, it is suggested that:
-    -Improving the country's political relations.
-    -Providing government facilities in the tourism region of Ilam Province.
-    -Improving the government's distribution policies in the tourism region of Ilam Province.
-    -Applying government incentive tax policies in the tourism region of Ilam Province.

- Considering the confirmation of the impact of socio-cultural factors on the development of rural tourism in Ilam province, it is suggested that:
- -Job creation and unemployment reduction in the tourism area of Ilam province
- -Maintaining the foundations of society in the tourism area of Ilam province
- -Applying the correct principles and methods of communicating with tourists
- -Training and generalizing communication methods in the tourism area of Ilam province
- -Active participation in international exhibitions abroad
- -The activity of Iranian media, especially radio and television, in the field of introducing the social, economic and cultural realities of Iran.
- Considering the confirmation of the impact of infrastructure factors on the development of rural tourism in Ilam province, it is suggested that:
- -Improving the welfare, service and accommodation system in the tourism sector and primary facilities
- -Direct transportation facilities between Ilam province and neighboring provinces

- Sources:
- -Azadkhani, Pakzad; Hosseinzadeh, Jafar; Salimi Bavandpour, Azin (2018), Investigating the socio-cultural effects of urban tourism development in Ilam, Two Quarterly Scientific-Research Journals of Urban Social Geography, Shahid Bahonar University of Kerman, Year 5, Issue 1, Consecutive 12, Spring and Summer 2018.
- -Ehsani, Mohammad et al. (2017). Identifying the dimensions of social entrepreneurship in sports and sports management, Volume 9, Issue 4.
- -Omidi, Nabi; Mohammadi, Esfandiar; Shiri, Ardeshir (2017). Developing strategies for the development of the tourism industry in Ilam province, Ilam Cultural Promotional Scientific Quarterly, Issue 9, pp. 56-57.
- -Imani, Bahram; Khosravi Mehr, Hamideh, Toorani, Ali (2015), Evaluation and ranking of obstacles to tourism development in Minoodasht County, Urban Tourism, Volume 2, Issue 1, Spring 2015, pp. 75-89.
- -Deh Deh Zadeh Milabi, Parvin; Ghafari Gilandeh, Ata; Gademi, Maryam; (2016). Ranking of tourist attractions based on the potential to attract tourists using a numerical taxonomy model, Quarterly Journal of Economics and Urban Management, No. 5.
- -Zal, Mohammad Hossein; Tabrizi, Nazanin; Mehr Ali Tabar, Morteza (2014). Effects of religious tourism on rural spaces, case study: Oji Abad village in Amol city, Quarterly Journal of Economics, Space and Rural Development, Year 5, No. 1, Spring 2016.
- -Saei Arsi, Iraj (2018), Sociological explanation of the obstacles to the socio-cultural and behavioral development of the tourism industry in Zanjan province, Quarterly Journal of Modern Tourism, Spring 2018 - No. 23 (24 pages - from 43 to 66)
- -Saei, Ali; Naeji, Mohammad Reza (2011). Sociological analysis of cultural tourism attraction in Iran: A case study of foreign tourists in Isfahan, Quarterly Journal of Social Sciences, No. 52.
- -Saeedi, Mahdieh (2014). Investigation of the role of security in the development of tourism in Birjand County, Master's thesis, Bakhtar University of Ilam.
- -Saghaei, Mehdi (2014). Strategic analysis of the areas of religious tourism welfare services in the holy metropolis of Mashhad with emphasis on the coherent quality of religious tourism, Sixth National Conference on Urban Planning and Management, Mashhad.

- -Sandgol, Mehdi, Sharifinia, Zahra (2016), Investigation of obstacles and problems of tourism development, case study: Qaemshahr County, Quarterly Journal of Geography (Regional Planning), Volume 7, No. 1, Winter 2016, pp. 71-83.

- -Shafia, Saeed; Firouzi, Ghazal; Gholami, Fatemeh Zahra (2017). Religious tourism, spiritual tourism or spirituality tourism, examining similarities and differences through content analysis, 10th International Conference on Economic Management.

- -Shafia, Saeed; Sabbaghpour Azarian, Mahdieh (2016). Explaining the concept of spirituality in tourism using content analysis, Tourism Management Quarterly, Year 11, Issue 35.

- -Saleh Doost, Mahsa; Tajzadeh Namin, Abolfazl (2015). Prioritizing film tourism marketing activities, Journal of Tourism Promotion and Development Program, Year 4, Issue 15, Winter 2015.

- - Safari, Warsi (2014). The role of social factors of tourism in the development of urban tourism, Urban Sociological Studies, 110-128.

- - Zargham Borujeni, Hamid; Azizi, Fatemeh. (2017). Evaluation of factors affecting the development of tourism in ancient-historical sites (fuzzy approach), History and Culture, 49(2): 32-9.

- - Talebi, Hadith; Modiri, Mahmoud; Torahani, Farzad. (2017). Prioritizing the components of tourism development in Iran with a fuzzy mixed multi-criteria decision-making approach, a case study: Cultural Heritage, Handicrafts and Tourism Organization of Iran, Journal of Tourism Planning and Development, 6(20): 94-114.

- - Tabatabaei, Seyedeh Mojgan (2017). Studying the impact of customs and culture on the development of rural tourism, Islamic Azad University, Heydariyeh Education Branch, Master's thesis.

- - Ana Bostani, Zahra; Rajabi, Azita (2014). Studying the effects of religious tourists on the development of rural settlements from the perspective of villagers, Journal of Rural Research and Planning, Year 3, Issue 7.

- - Farahani, Abolfazl; Esfahani, Noushin; Zarei, Mohsen; Khaleq Arati, Mohsen (2014). The role of destinations in the development of the sports tourism industry in a five-year period in the Emirate of Abu Dhabi, Sports Management Journal, Volume 6, Issue 2.

- - Fallahi, K. (2013). Strategy and Operations in Tour Management, Tehran: Cultural Research Office, Volume 1, First Edition.

- - Firujaian, Ali Asghar; Yousefi, Neda; Mirmohammad Tabar, Seyed Ahmad (2014). Functional analysis of religious tourism in Iran, Journal of Tourism Planning and Development, Year 3, Issue 8, Spring 2014.

- - Ghanbari et al. (2017). Study of the effects of urban tourism on the quality of life of citizens, case study of Yasuj city, Scientific and Research Quarterly Journal of Tourism, Year 6, Spring 2017.

- - Karimi, Saeed (2014). Entrepreneurship of agricultural tourism, a new strategy for rural development, Entrepreneurship Journal, No. 4.

- - Karimi Alavijeh, Mohammad Reza; Ahmadi, Mohammad Mehdi; Nazari, Mahsa (2016). Study of the effects of traditional values and Islamic values on the satisfaction and loyalty of foreign tourists in Qom, Quarterly Journal of Tourism Management Studies, Year 10, Issue 32.

- - Koolabadi, Jafar; Saghaei, Mehdi; Tajik, Esmaeil (2014). Comparative study of religious tourism in Iranian metropolises, case study, Qom, Shiraz and holy Mashhad.

- - Mohammadi Yeganeh, Behrouz; Cheraghi, Mehdi; Velaei, Mohammad (2013). The role of religious tourism in rural development with emphasis on quality of life and social capital; Case study: Qapichagh village, Miandoab county, Journal of Applied Research in Geographical Sciences, Year 13, Issue 30.
- - Mohaghegh Damad, Seyed Mostafa (2016). Tourism and spirituality, First Conference on Tourism and Spirituality, Tehran University of Science and Culture.
- - Mohipour Jaberi, Morteza (2014). Analysis of the role of tourism on the quality of life of citizens with emphasis on subjective indicators, case study of Fashm city (Shemiranat county) Urban tourism, Volume 1, Issue 1, pp. 35-45.
- - Marvati Sharifabadi, Ali; Abuhashemabadi, Farzaneh; Asadian Ardakani, Faezeh. (2016). Identifying and ranking the factors affecting the development of Yazd tourism industry with the fuzzy VIKOR approach, Quarterly Journal of Tourism and Development, 5(7): 129-147.
- - Marvati Sharifabadi, Ali; Azizi, Fatemeh, Jamshidi; Zeinat (2016). Analysis of factors affecting the satisfaction of domestic tourists in Yazd province using the fuzzy DEMET model, Quarterly Journal of Tourism Studies, Year 11, No. 72,33.
- - Moavan, Zahra; Movahed, Majid; Fahmi, Mansour (2017). Religious tourists' perception of the pilgrimage to the holy sites of Shirar city, an ethnographic study, Journal of Tourism Planning and Development, Year 6, No. 98,222.
- - Mousavi, Mirnajaf; Soltani, Nasser (2014). An analysis of the role of religious tourism in urban development (a study by Imam Zadeh Jafar (AS) Yazd city) Journal of Urban Research and Planning, Year 5, Issue 18, Fall 2014.
- - Mousavi, Seyed Najaf; Soltani, Nasser; Kashkouli; Ali Bagher (2014). Human Geography Research, Volume 46, Issue 4, Winter 2014, pp. 841-825.
- - Mir Karimi, Seyed Hamed; Sahar, Saeedi, Saeedi, Sepideh (2016). Principles and concepts of achieving a successful ecosystem, Human and Environment Quarterly, Issue 27, Summer 2016.
- - Nadalipour, Zahra (2013). Evaluating the quality of destination management from the perspective of competitive advantage, a case study, Chabahar region, Tourism Quarterly of the University of Science and Technology.
- - Nazarian, Asghar; Kaveh, Zalnejad; Mirzanejad, Reza (2015). Analysis of the effects of tourism on the development of villages and cities, case study: Sarein, Quarterly Journal of Rural Economics and Development, Issue 3.
- - Varmezyari, Hojat (2013). Designing a sustainable agricultural tourism model in Iran, PhD thesis, University of Agricultural Economics and Development, University of Tehran.
- - Veisi, Hadi, Mehmandost, Khadijeh (2015), Investigation of obstacles to the development of the international tourism industry in Iran with an emphasis on inbound tourism, Quarterly Journal of Geopolitics, Year 11, Issue 1, Spring 2015, pp. 135-156.
- - Hashempour, Seyedeh Fahimeh; Lahmian, Reza; Barari, Masoumeh (2012). Investigation of the economic and environmental effects of urban tourism from the perspective of citizens.
- - Yadegari, Mehdi; Mohammadi, Shahriar; Yarmohammadi Samani, Peyman (2015). Trust Model in Electronic Tourism, Tehran, Quarterly Journal of Tourism Management Studies, Allameh Tabatabaei University, Year 10, Issue 29, pp. 129-148.
- English Sources

- A.Aslan. Sendogdo. Ayes. Kocabacak. Sukru. Guven(2013)."The relationship between human resource management practices and organizational commitment: A field study", Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences 99 (2013) 818 – 827.

- Achmad Fadillah, Triana G. Dewi, and Arini Hardjauto(2012). Analysis of Alternative Strategy in Coastal Tourism Development in Aseh Besar, Indonesia after Tsunami Desaster, Jornal of Social science and Humanity, VOL2, No 3.

- Agapito,D.,valle.p.and mendes.j.(2014).Exploring a journal of Destination Marketing and Mangement ,2:62-73.

- Akrivosa, C., Reklitisb,P., Theodoroyianic, M. (2014) "Tourism Entrepreneurship and the Adoption of Sustainable Resources". The Case of Evritania Prefecture, Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences, 148, 378 – 382.

- Arash.H&Baradarni:s.(2014).European   Tourism   perspective   serviceson   Destination satisfaction in jordan,s in dusturies,procedia-social and Behavioral science.19,1416-1425.

- Aziz,Y.A.,sawdin,z,Awang.k.w.and Abdullah,z.(2015).developing an index for medical tourism .international Business management.9(4):412-415.

- Bahardeen.Fazel(2013),THE Muslim travel market, south Africa,CEO,crescentrating.

- Barbieri,Carla.Assessing the sustain ability of Agri tourism in the us:A comparison between Agri tourism   and other farm Enterpreneurial ventures. Journal of sustainable tourism 21.no.2(2013).252-270.

- Bohari,A bdul manaf,Wei Hin cheng&Fuad Nurwahida(2013),The competitveness of half food industry in Malaysia:A SWOT ICT an alysis,Geographia online TM Malaysia journal of society and space,vol,pp.1-9.

- Browen,Richard,l,lindamCox,and Morton Fox. The Interface between Tourism and Agriculture .journal of Tourism of studies(2013).43-54.

- Cejudo,A.B.,Hernaez,O.R. and Patterson,i.(2016).The strategies Impact of country of origin on senior Tourism Demand :The Need to Balance Global and local strategies ,journal of population Aging,Vol.9(4):345-373.

- Connell.j.(2013).contemporary   medical   tourism   :conceptualisation   ,culture   and commodification . Tourism management,34:1-13.

- Credwell,J.W.(2013).Research   design:Qualitative,quantitative,and   mixed   methods approaches:Sage publications.

- Daniel Anthoni. Sihasal e, L.Hakim, A.Suharyant, Soemarno(2016). The strategy of potential tourism development in Namalatu Beach at Nusaniwe Sub District, Ambon city, Indonesia, jornal of engineering and science , VOL3,Issu1,pp.39.45.

- Dehgan,F.(2010),Tourism Industry in Islamic countries and its Role in the unity of the Islamic world. proceedings of the Fourth International congress of the Islamic world Geographers (2010).(in Persian).

- Dey.B.,sarm,M.K.(2010).Information source usage among motive –based segments of travelers to newly emerging tourist destinations .Tourism management.31(3).341-344.

- Dijana. Oreski(2016). Strategy development by using SOWT-AHP, TEM jornal, VOL 1, No4.

- Dimitrorski,Darko&Marinkovic senic Vladimir(2015).Atticudes of Serbian urban Residents Toward Tourism development,Economics and organization .vol.12.NO2.2015.PP.143-155.

- Egresi,I.,bayram,B.,Kars,F.and Kesik,O.(2012).unlocking the potential of religious tourism in Toukey , Geo journal of Tourism and Geosties,Year v no.1.,vol.9.may

- EID,R,(2013).Integrating Muslim customer perceived vale,satisfacti.Layalty and Retention in the Tourism Industry :An empirical study. International Journal of Tourism Research.
- Govender,K.(2011)Astronomy for African development International Astronomical.,no:22
- GU,D.,Z,H.,Brown,T.,Hoenig,H.and Zong.Y.(2015).Tourism Experiences and self-Rated Health Among older Adults in China, journal of Aging and Health.28(4):675-703.
- Han,H.,&Hyun,s.d(2015).Customer retention medical tourism industry:Impact of quality,satisfaction,trust,and price reasonableness,,Tourism Management,46,20-29.
- Honeck,D,(2012).LCD Export Dirersification , Employment Generation and the green economy: what roles for tourism linkages, world trade organization economic research and statistics staff working paper ERS-2012-24.December 2012.
- Jaafar, M., Rasoolimanesh, M., Tuan Lonik, K (2015) "Tourism growth and entrepreneurship: Empirical analysis of development of rural highlands", Tourism Management Perspectives, 14, 17–24.
- Jafari,Jafar&Scot,Noel(2010).,Tourism I the Muslim World ,Emerald,uk.
- Kadiyalia,V.and Kosovab,R(2013).Inter-industry employment spillovers from tourism inflows Regional science and urban Economic.43(2):272-281.
- Katsoni,Vrondou,O.(2016).Marketing to occasional sporting event tourist: Profiles ,travelling patterns ,and information cannels journal of policy Research in Tourism leisure and events,1-17.
- Kim.H.Woo.E.and Uysal.M(2015).Tourism experience and quality of life among elderly tourists, journal of Tourism management .vol.46:456-476.
- Kim,Y.H.,Duncan,j.l.&jai.T-M.(2014).Segmenting the collegiate football game spectator :a cluster analysis approach sport, Business and management :An International journal ,6(1),76-96.
- Kreiner,N.C,Shmueli,D.F.,&GAL,M.B.(2015).Understanding conflicts at religious-tourism sites: The Bahai world center ,Israel. Tourism management perspective ,vol16,pp.228-236.
- Musai.Maysam.(2013)Motivational Factor of Travel war places in Iran, International journal of Acadmic Research in Business and social sciences,vol.3,no.1,pp.310-318.
- Mustafayevad,A.A.,Nadirova,G.E.,Kalireve,s.&Aktaulova,B.Zn(2012).Destinnation branding strategies on Halal hospitality and its effect on tourist. s intention toward Malaysia.3rd international conference on business and economic research proceeding .Banding, Andonesia.
- Niemela,Titta.(2010)Motivation Factors in Dark Tourism case:House Of Terror ,The Factulty of Tourism And Hospitality Degree programme in Tourism in and Hospitality management nature and soft Adeventure Tourism ,Bachelots thesi,LAHTL university of applied sciences.
- Nieminen Katri(2012).Religious tourism a finish perspective.
- Oh.C.O(2005).the contribution Development to Economic Growth in the Koreah Economy. Tourism Management,NO26,39-44.
- Page,s,j,Hartwell,H.,johns,N.,Fyall,A.,Ladkin,A.,& Hemingway,A.(2017).Wellness tourism and and small busness development in a uk coastal restort:public engament in practice .tourism management ,60.437-466 doi:10.1016/j.tourism.2016.12.014.
- Rahman ,m.k.(2014).Motivating factors of Islamic Tourism,s Destination Loyalty:An Empirical Investigation in Malaysia.Journal of Tourism and Hosptiality Mangement.63-77.
- Roche,s.Speake.D.F.O.Joseph,m(2013).A model of sporting event as economic development. sport, Business and management :An International Journal,3(2),147-157.

- Richardson. J. Alan.(2017)." The Relationship between Management and as Professions and Technologies of Practice". University of Windsor Scholarship at Uwindsor, Vol. 30, No. 3, 2013, 644-659.
- Richards,G.(2013).Creativity and tourism in the city,current Issues in Tourism ,17(2):1-26.
- Symanka,E.(2012).Constraction of the model of Health Tourism Innovativenss . procedia-social and Behavioval sciences.213:1008-1014.
- S zanajder,Micahal,Lucyna Przeborska,and Franck scrimgeour. Agri tourism :cabi.2009.
- tourism ,Retrieved Match 17th .2013from http://www2unwto.org/en/content/why-tourism.
- Yilmaza, S., Dincera, F., Dincera, (2015), "The Economic Contribution of Turkish Tourism Entrepreneurship on the Development of Tourism Movements In Islamic Countries", World Conference on Technology, Innovation and Entrepreneurship, Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences, 195, 413 – 422.